

Message Text

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 01 STATE 175570 TOSEC 080031
ORIGIN PA-02

INFO OCT-01 SS-15 SSO-00 ISO-00 CCO-00 /018 R

DRAFTED BY PA:SACORNWELL:SAC
APPROVED BY PA/M:D.O.NEWBERRY
S/S-O - R. CASTRODALE
DESIRED DISTRIBUTION
PA, S/S, PA/PRESS

-----109328 121658Z /41

P 121632Z JUL 78 ZFF4
FM SECSTATE WASHDC
TO USDEL SECRETARY PRIORITY

UNCLAS STATE 175570 TOSEC 080031

FOR CARTER FROM PA

E.O. 11652: N/A

TAGS: SOPN, OVIP (VANCE)

SUBJECT: PRESS MATERIAL

1. HERewith FULL TEXT NEW YORK TIMES BY-LINER BY WILLIAM E. FARRELL, WEDNESDAY, JULY 12, HEADED "ISRAELIS ANALYZE CAIRO'S NEW PEACE PROPOSALS AND TERM THEM A RETREAT."
2. JERUSALEM, -- A WEEK BEFORE A MEETING IN LONDON OF REPRESENTATIVES OF THE UNITED STATES, ISRAEL AND EGYPT ON THE STALLED MIDDLE EAST PEACE EFFORT, ISRAELI OFFICIALS ARE CONTENDING THAT EGYPT'S RECENT PEACE PLAN IS A RETREAT FROM THE STANCE IT TOOK IN DIRECT TALKS WITH ISRAEL.
3. AT A BRIEFING TODAY FOR REPORTERS, MEIR ROSENNE, LEGAL ADVISER OF THE ISRAELI FOREIGN MINISTRY, ANALYZED THE EGYPTIAN PLAN BIT BY BIT AND CLAUSE BY CLAUSE. HE CALLED UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 02 STATE 175570 TOSEC 080031

THE PLAN "A CHANGE FOR THE WORSE."

4. LATER, ZALMAN SHOVAL, A MEMBER OF PARLIAMENT WHO IS CHAIRMAN OF A SPECIAL COMMITTEE ON FOREIGN INFORMATION FOR FOREIGN MINISTER MOSHE DAYAN, SAID: "WE SEE IT AS A VERY EXTREMIST PROPOSAL."

5. "THIS IS A PLAN MORE TO BE REJECTED THAN ACCEPTED,"

MR. SHOVAL ADDED.

6. TWO DAYS AGO, THE ISRAELI CABINET REJECTED THE EGYPTIAN PLAN AS "UNACCEPTABLE" AND PRIME MINISTER MENACHEM BEGIN TOLD REPORTERS IT WAS "COMPLETELY UNACCEPTABLE TO ISRAEL."

7. COORDINATED CAMPAIGN OF ANALYSIS. THE BEGIN GOVERNMENT SEEMS TO BE UNDERTAKING A COORDINATED EFFORT TO ANALYZE EVERY ASPECT OF CAIRO'S PROPOSAL PUBLICLY BEFORE THE LONDON CONFERENCE, SCHEDULED TO START NEXT TUESDAY. THE OFFICIAL ANALYSIS OF THE EGYPTIAN PROPOSAL DEEMED AS NEGATIVE EVEN THOSE ASPECTS OF THE PLAN THAT SOME ISRAELIS LAST WEEK WERE SAYING HAD POSITIVE ELEMENTS.

8. THE ANALYSIS WAS ACCOMPANIED BY ISRAELI ASSERTIONS THAT THE PEACE PLAN SET FORTH IN DECEMBER BY MR. BEGIN WAS A POSITIVE ONE.

9. COUPLED WITH THE ANALYSIS ARE ASSERTIONS THAT NOT MUCH IS EXPECTED OUT OF THE LONDON PARLEY BUT THAT ISRAEL WOULD ATTEND THE MEETING TO DEFLECT ANY CHARGES THAT IT IS ATTEMPTING TO OBSTRUCT A REVIVAL OF DIRECT ISRAELI-EGYPTIAN CONTACTS. THE MEETING IS TO BE ATTENDED BY FOREIGN MINISTER DAYAN, FOREIGN MINISTER MOHAMMED IBRAHIM KAMEL OF EGYPT AND SECRETARY OF STATE CYRUS R. VANCE.

UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 03 STATE 175570 TOSEC 080031

10. ISRAELI CRITICISM OF EGYPT'S PLAN. MR. ROSENNE LISTED THE FOLLOWING CRITICISM OF THE EGYPTIAN PLAN:

11. THE TITLE OF THE EGYPTIAN PLAN -- "PROPOSALS RELATIVE TO WITHDRAWAL FROM THE WEST BANK AND GAZA AND SECURITY ARRANGEMENTS" -- REFERS ONLY TO ISRAELI WITHDRAWAL AND MAKES NO MENTION OF PEACE TREATIES. THIS, HE SAID, WAS A TOUGHER LINE THAN WAS TAKEN BY EGYPT IN DIRECT CONTACTS IN THE FALL AND WINTER.

12. THE EGYPTIAN PLAN OMITTS REFERENCES TO UNITED NATIONS SECURITY COUNCIL RESOLUTION 242 AND RESOLUTION 338 -- THE INTENDED FRAMEWORK FOR ARAB-ISRAELI CONTACTS. THIS, HE SAID, REPRESENTS A "DISTORTION" SINCE THE EGYPTIAN PLAN CALLS FOR A COMPLETE ISRAELI WITHDRAWAL FROM THE ARAB LANDS CAPTURED BY ISRAEL DURING THE 1967 WAR, WHILE THE RESOLUTIONS TALK OF WITHDRAWAL BUT NOT OF "TOTAL" WITHDRAWAL.

13. THE PLAN TAKES A TOUGHER LINE THAN THE SO-CALLED ASWAN FORMULA ON THE PROBLEM OF THE PALESTINIANS. THE ASWAN FORMULA ON THE PROBLEM OF THE PALESTINIANS. THE

ASWAN FORMULA WAS WORKED OUT BY PRESIDENT CARTER AND PRESIDENT ANWAR EL-SADAT DURING A MEETING AT THE CITY ON THE UPPER NILE. THE FORMULA, WHICH THE ISRAELIS HAVE NOT ACCEPTED, TALKS OF PALESTINIAN PARTICIPATION IN THE SETTLEMENT OF THEIR PROBLEMS. BUT THE EGYPTIAN PLAN TALKS OF THE PALESTINIANS DETERMINING THEIR FUTURE WITHOUT THE PARTICIPATION OF OTHERS, MR. ROSENNE SAID.

14. THE EGYPTIAN PLAN TALKS OF PALESTINIAN REFUGEES BUT NOT OF THE JEWISH REFUGEES WHO FLED FROM ARAB COUNTRIES TO ISRAEL. IN ADDITION, THE PLAN CALLS FOR PUTTING INTO EFFECT "RELEVANT" GENERAL ASSEMBLY RESOLUTIONS -- SOME OF WHICH ARE CRITICIZED AS ANTI-ISRAEL, SUCH AS ONE EQUATING ZIONISM WITH RACISM. MR. ROSENNE SAID THESE WERE NOT UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 04 STATE 175570 TOSEC 080031

LEGALLY BINDING ON ISRAEL.

15. THE INCLUSION OF UNITED NATIONS PARTICIPATION IN TALKS, MR. ROSENNE SAID, WOULD MEAN A UNITED NATIONS ROLE TO EXPEDITE ISRAELI WITHDRAWAL FROM OCCUPIED ARAB TERRITORY BUT WOULD NOT PROVIDE ANY GUARANTEE OF ISRAEL'S SECURITY NEEDS.

16. BY CALLING FOR THE ABOLITION OF THE ISRAELI MILITARY GOVERNMENT IN THE WEST BANK AND THE GAZA STRIP AT THE OUTSET OF A FIVE-YEAR TRANSITION PERIOD, MR. ROSENNE CONTENDED, ISRAEL'S ROLE IN THE FUTURE OF THE TERRITORIES WOULD BE TERMINATED. EARLIER, THIS STIPULATION IN THE EGYPTIAN PLAN WAS SAID TO HAVE LEFT OPEN THE QUESTION OF A CONTINUED ISRAELI MILITARY PRESENCE FOR SECURITY PURPOSES, A KEY DEMAND FOUND IN MR. BEGIN'S PLAN.

17. A CALL FOR ISRAELI WITHDRAWAL FROM THE OLD CITY OF JERUSALEM, WHICH MR. ROSENNE SAID DID NOT COME UP DURING DIRECT ISRAELI-EGYPTIAN TALKS AT ISMAILIA ON THE SUEZ CANAL IN DECEMBER. BUT IT WAS MENTIONED BY PRESIDENT SADAT DURING HIS ADDRESS TO THE ISRAELI PARLIAMENT DURING HIS VISIT LAST NOVEMBER. EARLIER, SOME ISRAELI OFFICIALS SAID A POSITIVE ASPECT OF THE SADAT PLAN WAS THAT IT DID NOT MENTION THE PALESTINE LIBERATION ORGANIZATION. THE P.L.O. HAS BEEN BRANDED A "TERRORIST" ORGANIZATION BY THE ISRAELIS BECAUSE ITS CHARTER CALLS FOR THE LIQUIDATION OF ISRAEL AS A JEWISH STATE, AND ISRAEL HAS STEADFASTLY REFUSED TO NEGOTIATE WITH THE P.L.O.

18. TODAY, MR. ROSENNE DISPUTED THE INTERPRETATION THAT THE CAIRO PLAN DID NOT REFER TO THE DEMANDS OF THE P.L.O., SAYING THAT THE TEXT OF THE SADAT PROPOSAL CONTAINED UNCLASSIFIED

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 05 STATE 175570 TOSEC 080031

"NOTHING CONTRARY TO THE PHILOSOPHY OF THE P.L.O."

19. THE EGYPTIAN PLAN ALSO CALLS FOR THE DISMANTLING OF THE NUMEROUS ISRAELI SETTLEMENTS IN THE WEST BANK AND THE GAZA STRIP. IN PRIOR CONTACTS, MR. SHOVAL SAID, "THEY CERTAINLY GAVE US TO UNDERSTAND THAT THIS WAS A MATTER

THAT COULD BE NEGOTIATED."

20. ANOTHER DRAWBACK, MR. SHOVAL SAID, WAS THAT, EVEN IF ISRAEL ACCEDED TO THE EGYPTIAN DEMANDS FOR A FULL WITHDRAWAL, WHICH IS HIGHLY UNLIKELY, THE EGYPTIAN PLAN WAS SILENT ON THE SUBJECT OF DEMILITARIZATION OF THE PRESENTLY OCCUPIED TERRITORIES.

21. A RISK SEEN IN PALESTINIAN STATE. "THE APPROACH HERE HAS ALL THE INGREDIENTS OF THE ESTABLISHMENT OF A SEPARATE PALESTINIAN STATE WITH ALL THE RISKS INHERENT IN SUCH A THING TO US," MR. SHOVAL SAID. ISRAEL HAS LONG OPPOSED HAVING A SEPARATE PALESTINIAN STATE BETWEEN IT AND JORDAN, SAYING IT WOULD BE VENGEFUL AND A CONSTANT THREAT TO ISRAEL'S SECURITY.

22. "WE ARE VERY PESSIMISTIC ABOUT THE OUTCOME OF LONDON," HE SAID IN REFERENCE TO THE COMING MEETING. "BUT WE DON'T WANT TO DISREGARD ANY OPPORTUNITY."

23. OTHER ISRAELI OFFICIALS SAID THAT SOME OF THE PESSIMISM STEMMED FROM A BELIEF OF MR. DAYAN THAT MR. KAMEL WOULD NOT BE EMPOWERED TO MAKE ON-THE-SPOT DECISIONS WITHOUT CONSULTING PRESIDENT SADAT AND THEREFORE THERE WOULD BE AN ATMOSPHERE IN LONDON THAT LACKED A SPIRIT OF GIVE-AND-TAKE.

24. ONE OFFICIAL SAID THE LONDON PARLEY WAS "A NECESSARY STAGE OF THE PLAY BUT THE NEXT ACT WILL BE THE BRINGING UP

UNCLASSIFIED

PAGE 06 STATE 175570 TOSEC 080031

OF AMERICAN IDEAS" ON THE STALLED PEACE EFFORT. END TEXT.
CHRISTOPHER

UNCLASSIFIED

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: X
Capture Date: 01 jan 1994
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: TOSEC, PRESS SUMMARIES
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Draft Date: 12 jul 1978
Decaption Date: 01 jan 1960
Decaption Note:
Disposition Action: n/a
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment:
Disposition Date: 01 jan 1960
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1978STATE175570
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: SACORNWELL:SAC
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: N/A
Errors: N/A
Expiration:
Film Number: D780285-0995
Format: TEL
From: STATE
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1978/newtext/t19780767/aaaaceej.tel
Line Count: 219
Litigation Code IDs:
Litigation Codes:
Litigation History:
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Message ID: 96c87e76-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Office: ORIGIN PA
Original Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 4
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: n/a
Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Reference: n/a
Retention: 0
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 29 mar 2005
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review Media Identifier:
Review Release Date: N/A
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
SAS ID: 2028237
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: PRESS MATERIAL
TAGS: SOPN, OVIP, NEW YORK TIMES, (VANCE, CYRUS R), (FARRELL, WILLIAM E)
To: SECRETARY
Type: TE
vdkgvwkey: odbc://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS_Docs/96c87e76-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Review Markings:
Sheryl P. Walter
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
20 Mar 2014
Markings: Sheryl P. Walter Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 20 Mar 2014